



DRAFT

City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD **MINUTES**

Monday, October 10, 2011 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 3:00 P.M.

BOARD MEMBERS:

GLEN DEISLER, CHAIR - PRESENT
DENISE WOOLERY, VICE-CHAIR - PRESENT
BERNI BERNSTEIN - PRESENT
BRIAN MILLER - PRESENT
FRED SWEENEY - PRESENT
JIM ZIMMERMAN - PRESENT

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: DALE FRANCISCO - ABSENT

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: MICHAEL JORDAN - ABSENT

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor - ABSENT
MICHELLE BEDARD, Planning Technician - PRESENT
KATHLEEN GOO, Commission Secretary - PRESENT

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Single Family Design Board is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/sfdb and then clicking on the *Meeting Video* tab.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Chair Deisler.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Deisler, Woolery, Bernstein, Miller, Sweeney, and Zimmerman.
Members absent: None.
Staff present: Bedard, Limón, and Goo.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Single Family Design Board for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 26, 2011.**

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of **September 26, 2011**, as amended.

Action: Bernstein/Zimmerman, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Sweeney abstained/Deisler abstained from Item #6/ Miller abstained from Items #1-3/Zimmerman abstained from Items #7-9).

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **October 3, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Fred Sweeney** and **Brian Miller**.

Action: Woolery/Zimmerman, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Denise abstained).

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar for **October 10, 2011**. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by **Denise Woolery** and **Jim Zimmerman**.

Action: Zimmerman/Miller, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Deisler abstained from Item C).

Board member Zimmerman reported to the Board on the Consent Item #B, 912 Medio Road referred to Full Board and tentatively scheduled for the October 24, 2011 full board meeting.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Limon announced the Advisory Board vacancies and sought Board members assistance the City in seeking a *licensed* landscape architect to fill the vacancy on the SFDB. The deadline for applications is October 17, 2011.
2. Ms. Bedard made the following reminders and announcements:
 - a) A Council appeal for 1359 and 1383 Santa Teresita Streets has been tentatively scheduled for the October 18, 2011 hearing. Board member Sweeney will represent the Board at that appeal hearing.
 - b) A Council appeal for 1402 Grand Avenue/860 Jimeno Road has been tentatively scheduled for tomorrow, the October 11, 2011 hearing. Chair Deisler will represent the Board at that appeal hearing.
3. Ms. Goo took a poll of members who would be able to attend the Monday, November 21, 2011, Full Board meeting just prior to the Thanksgiving Day Holiday. The required quorum results (of at least 4 members) were as follows:
 - a) Deisler – Absent
 - b) Bernstein - TBD
 - c) Sweeney - Present
 - d) Miller - Present
 - e) Woolery - Present
 - f) Zimmerman - Present

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:13 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 3:28 P.M. ***

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**1. 1303 FERRELO RD - LOT 28****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-271-028
Application Number: MST2005-00082
Owner: Kevin Goodwin
Designer: Goodwin Design

(This project is scheduled for a Review After Final for a revised design to reconfigure the site grading and slope. The total onsite grading is approximately 188 cubic yards of cut and 188 cubic yards of fill and will be balanced on site. The goal of the revised site grading is to restore the site to the original elevation and slightly increase the building pad. Other site work includes erosion control and addition of site boulders. No changes are proposed to the 3,493 square foot, two-story, single-family residence, with an attached 599 square foot two-car garage, which received Final Approval on January 2, 2007.)

(Second Review of Review After Final. Project requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Grading Findings per SBMC 22.69.050. The project was last reviewed by SFDB on June 20, 2011).

(3:28)

Present: Kevin Goodwin, Owner.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

- 1) Miranda Field, (submitted letter) opposition; expressed concerns about changes made from the original approval.

An email was acknowledged from Diana Miller expressing concerns regarding grading quantities.

Public comment closed at 3:34 p.m.

The applicant confirmed to the Board that there will be no increase to the building size or grading cut and fill for the proposed project.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final as submitted, acknowledging balance of the site grading and use of appropriate erosion control and landscaping.

Action: Woolery/Miller, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained.).

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**2. 1020 PLACIDO AVE****R-4 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-262-008

Application Number: MST2011-00252

Owner: Abigail Solomon-Godeau

Architect: Christine Pierron

(Proposal for alterations to an existing two-story 2,271 square foot single-family residence to be converted to a congregate care facility. The exterior alterations include a new accessible parking space, accessible ramp, stairs, trash enclosure, deck, and site walls exceeding 3.5 feet in the front yard.)

(In-Progress Review for change in proposed exterior materials, revised windows and doors, and revised trash/recycling location. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Staff Hearing Officer review of a Performance Standard Permit and a requested zoning modification. The project was last reviewed on July 5, 2011.)

(3:39)

Present: Christine Pierron, Architect.

Public comment opened at 3:43 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Staff Hearing Officer to return to Consent with comments:

- 1) The Board had positive comments regarding the proposed shingles, general design, fence, deck, and porch overhang.
- 2) The Board looks forward to further section details on exterior architectural elements.
- 3) Applicant to provide a color board and cut sheets for proposed lighting.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED AT 3:50 P.M., AND RECOVERED AT 4:00 P.M. ***

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**3. 276 SCHULTE LN****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-230-006

Application Number: MST2011-00360

Owner: John Illgen

Engineer: Flowers and Associates, Inc.

(Proposal to repair and stabilize an area of slope failure, construct new drainage facilities and repair a portion of the existing paved driveway serving the existing residence. Proposed grading includes 460 cubic yards of cut and 610 cubic yards of fill. Approximately 15 ornamental trees are proposed to be removed. A single-family residence and carport currently exist on the project site. No new floor area is proposed. The project site is located on an approximately 3.25 acre site in the Hillside Design District.)

(Project requires Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and Grading Findings per SBMC 22.69.050. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Stormwater Management Program.)

(4:00)

Present: Ron Rohr, Civil Engineer for Flowers and Associates, Inc.; Kathleen Blankenship, Agent; and Kandace Illgen, Property Owner.

Public comment opened at 4:17 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with comments:

- 1) The Board made the Hillside Design District and Slope Lot findings that the development, including the proposed structures and grading, is appropriate to the site, designed to avoid visible scarring, and does not significantly modify the natural topography of the site or the natural appearance of any ridgeline or hillside.
- 2) The Board made the grading findings that the proposed grading will not significantly increase siltation in or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages or water storage facilities to which the property drains.
- 3) The Board made the vegetation removal findings that the proposed vegetation removal will not significantly increase the siltation in or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages or water storage facilities to which the property drains; removal will not cause a substantial loss of southern oak woodland habitat; and removal will comply with all applicable provisions of Chapter 22.10, "Vegetation Removal".
- 4) Provide a hydro-seed mix that is acceptable to the City.
- 5) The applicant is encouraged to notify adjacent and down slope neighbors regarding pending construction activities.

Action: Woolery/Sweeney, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 652 RICARDO AVE****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-170-025
Application Number: MST2011-00368
Owner: Roy Calvin Petersen
Architect: Tom Ochsner

(Proposal to construct a 931 square foot one-story addition to an existing 1,611 square foot one-story residence with attached two-car garage located on a 20,831 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. A portion of the existing residence will be demolished and reconstructed. Proposal includes a new courtyard area with a new fountain and a new covered porch. The total development proposed is 2,958 square feet and is 63% of the maximum floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) guideline. This project addresses violations listed in ZIR2011-00176 to include the demolition of the accessory structure.)

(Compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program (SWMP) is required prior to Final Approval.)

(4:29)

Present: Ray Ames for Architect, Tom Ochsner.

Public comment opened at 4:38 p.m.

- 1) Al Carson (adjacent neighbor), support project; with expressed concerns regarding height of structure or any proposed second-story height that might affect his property values or private views. The Board confirmed with the applicant that there is no second-story proposed.

Public comment closed at 4:40 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1) Provide the following additional information for further review:
 - a. Two horizontal building sections, and one longitudinal building section;
 - b. A depiction of the street elevation, including the westerly neighbor on Ricardo Avenue to compare plate and roof ridge heights; include photo simulations;
 - c. Provide neighborhood photographs;
 - d. Provide a roof plan.
 - e. A preliminary landscape plan; delineate all required open space on the plans.
 - f. Clearly delineate locations and heights of all existing and any new site walls and/or fences;
 - g. A complete site section details from Ricardo Avenue dropping to the south (including north-south), in relation to the southerly residential neighbor;
 - h. Provide quarter-inch section studies of the porch areas relating to the change in slope;
 - i. Further studies of the proportions for the window, door, and garage door fenestrations on the elevations;
 - j. Provide details and show all existing and proposed structures on site-plan, including the out-building and
 - k. Relocate fountain feature outside of the required front setback, as directed by staff,
- 2) Provide compliance with Tier 3 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to submitting for Final Review.

Action: Sweeney/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**5. 1708 CALLE BOCA DEL CANON****R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 041-062-017

Application Number: MST2011-00376

Owner: Marlene Roberts, Revocable Trust

Designer: Mehdi Hadighi

(Proposal to construct a new 331 square foot second-story addition to an existing 1,351 square foot one-story, single-family residence with a basement and an attached 334 square foot one-car garage, resulting in a total development of 2,016 square feet on a 6,390 square foot lot. The 1,351 square foot existing residence includes a 344 square foot basement which is exempt from the floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) calculation. The proposal is 60% of the maximum required FAR.)

(5:00)

Present: Mehdi Hadighi, Designer.

Public comment opened at 5:27 p.m. As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

An email of support from Douglas Scott was acknowledged.

Straw vote: How many Board members are *opposed* to the proposed second-story design solution? 0/6 (none opposed).

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with comments:

- 1) The Board appreciates the provided photographs and presentation of the site and surrounding neighborhood.
- 2) Study the second-floor front window opening on the south elevation.
- 3) Study the trellis element over the garage door in relation to the first floor.
- 4) Study the roof element and material at the gable end on the south elevation.
- 5) Study the window opening and roof line at the gable end on the north elevation.
- 6) Provide a section study on the canopies over the two windows at the east elevation on the second floor.
- 7) Provide a color board; and material cut sheets.
- 8) Provide cut-sheets and details on the garage door.
- 9) Specify proposed landscaping at the area of existing driveway to be removed.
- 10) Study the chimney height.

Action: Sweeney/Zimmerman, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Deisler opposed).

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:40 P.M. ******** MEETING BRIEFLY RE-OPENED AND RE-ADJOURNED AT 5:43 P.M. ****

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00 a.m.):**CONTINUED ITEM****A. 135 MORADA LN****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 055-120-026
Application Number: MST2011-00198
Owner: Elizabeth Gradinger
Architect: R. Deming Isaacson

(Proposal to construct a new 343 square foot detached accessory structure and a 232 square foot deck on a 45,764 square foot lot, located in the Hillside Design District, which is currently developed with an existing 2,282 square foot one-story single-family residence, and a 504 square foot detached two-car garage. The proposal includes 9.39 cubic yards of cut and the proposed removal of eight existing lemon trees.)

(Tier 3 SWMP compliance required prior to Final Approval; and Geological/Soils report prior to issuance of a building permit. Project was last reviewed on May 16, 2011.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the condition to obtain approval from Ann Marx for compliance with High Fire Area requirements.

CONTINUED ITEM**B. 912 MEDIO RD****E-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-262-002
Application Number: MST2011-00244
Owner: David Edward Duron, Trust
Applicant: Bob Easton

(Proposal to construct a new 285 square foot one-story master bedroom and kitchen addition, a new 457 square foot deck, and an interior remodel to an existing 985 square foot one-story single-family residence with an attached 212 square foot one-car garage. The proposal will result in a one-story 1,482 square foot single-family residence on a 13,334 square foot lot located in the Hillside Design District.)

(Compliance with Tier 3 Stormwater Management Program is required prior to Final Approval. The project was last reviewed on June 13, 2011.)

Continued two-weeks to Full Board, to review the proposed second-story deck with regard to the recommended guideline for a 15-foot setback from the interior property line.

NEW ITEM**C. 356 EL CIELITO RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 021-081-010
Application Number: MST2011-00366
Owner: Reichel Family Trust
Architect: Harrison Design
Landscape Architect: Sydney Baumgartner

(Proposal to construct a new single-family residence to replace the previous residence destroyed in the Tea Fire. Proposal includes a new 3,959 square foot, two-level single-family residence with an attached 695 square foot, three-car garage on the basement level, located on a 43,592 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. The project includes a new swimming pool, new site retaining walls, 1,800 cubic yards of cut, and 1,000 cubic yards of fill. The proposal total of 4,654 square feet, which includes a 50% basement calculation discount, is 85% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. .)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code with the conditions:

- 1) The use of Apentia plantings is discouraged in the landscaping.
- 2) Obtain approval from Ann Marx for compliance with High Fire Area requirements.

NEW ITEM**D. 1624 OLIVE ST****R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-132-018
Application Number: MST2011-00369
Owner: Caleb Rhoads
Designer: Paul Olsen

(Proposal to legalize the unpermitted demolition of a detached two-car garage and to allow two uncovered parking spaces totaling 473 square feet and associated landscaping. Also proposed is to remove an existing first-story window from the east elevation. Current development on site consists of a 1,602 square foot, two-story, single-family residence. No new floor area is proposed. The floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR) on this 5,525 square foot parcel is 63% of the maximum guideline FAR. This project will address violations in Enforcement Case ENF2011-00410.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 and the finding that the Parking Requirements have been met as stated in Subsection 28.90.100 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code.

NEW ITEM**E. 300 LAS ALTURAS RD****A-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-312-017

Application Number: MST2011-00373

Owner: Peter and Patricia Altavilla, Living Trust

Applicant: Cesar Cruz

(Proposal to construct a 238 square foot, second-floor addition to an existing 1,679 square foot two-story residence with an attached two-car garage located on a 17,500 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. A 236 square foot deck addition is included in the proposal. The proposed total of 2,225 square feet is 54% of the floor-to-lot area guideline (FAR).)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project requires compliance with Tier 2 Storm Water Management Program (SWMP) prior to Final Approval.)

Continued indefinitely to Consent with comments:

- 1) The existing stair to be relocated closer to the street and is to be clear of the overhead deck.
- 2) The Board recommends a cable railing.
- 3) It was suggested the applicant incorporate a stone veneer adjacent to the garage.
- 4) Provide additional landscaping details.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by **Jim Zimmerman** and **Denise Woolery**.